

Compose

- Inbox
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

- Meet
- New meeting
 - Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
Start a new one

45 of 186

Trismawati <trismawati@upm.ac.id> Fri, Apr 22, 2:42 PM

to Materialia

Dear Evelyn KF Yim,

I am very grateful because the article has been accepted for publication in Materialia. Moreover I was added to be a Reviewer on Materialia. I am very happy and really appreciate it. And as a reviewer, I will give my best the Materialia journal.

Thank you very much.

Best regards,

Dr. Trismawati
Department of Industrial Engineering, Panca Marga University, Probolinggo, 67271, Indonesia

Reply Forward

No new notifications

Compose

- Inbox
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
[Start a new one](#)

45 of 186

Your Submission Inbox x

Materialia <em@editorialmanager.com> Fri, Apr 22, 8:40 AM

to me

Ms. Ref. No.: MTLA-D-22-00113R1
Title: The role of fatty acid of Morinda citrifolia oil as surface-active chemicals on the deinking process of waste paper
Materialia

Dear Dr. Trsimawati,

I am pleased to inform you that your paper "The role of fatty acid of Morinda citrifolia oil as surface-active chemicals on the deinking process of waste paper" has been accepted for publication in Materialia.

The manuscript will now be transferred to our production team that will be in contact with you shortly.

Below are comments from the editor and reviewers.

We appreciate and value your contribution to Materialia. We regularly invite authors of recently published manuscript to participate in the peer review process. If you were not already part of the journal's reviewer pool, you have now been added to it. We look forward to your continued participation in our journal, and we hope you will consider us again for future submissions.

Yours sincerely,

Compose

Inbox

- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

Meet

- New meeting
- Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
Start a new one

Submission Confirmation for MTLA-D-22-00113R1

60 of 186

Materialia <em@editorialmanager.com>
to me

Sat, Apr 9, 2:27 PM

Ms. Ref. No.: MTLA-D-22-00113R1

Title: The role of fatty acid of Morinda citrifolia oil as surface-active chemicals on the deinking process of waste paper
Materialia

Dear Dr. Trismawati,

This message is to acknowledge that we have received your revised manuscript for reconsideration for publication in Materialia.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging into the Editorial Manager as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/mtla/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to Materialia.

Kind regards,

Editorial Manager
Materialia

.....

Compose

Inbox

Starred

Snoozed

Important

Sent

Drafts

Meet

New meeting

Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
Start a new one



90 of 186

Reviewer #2: This manuscript reported the use of fatty acid derived from morinda citrifolia oil as surface-active chemicals on ink removal. The manuscript can be useful, but major revision is needed before it can be published.

1) The title of the paper needs to be improved so as to better reflect the content of the research. The title starts with "recent experimental advances", making it look like a review paper, but in fact it is a research article.

2) The work reported uses fatty acid from morinda citrifolia oil for ink removal, but the fruit of morinda citrifolia can be used for food and traditional herb, so would the use of the seed oil for ink removal be cost effective? Or the seed is a kind of waste stream so the method reported by this research is a strategy of utilizing inexpensive food waste for value-added applications? Some general introduction on this aspect could be meaningful.

3) The Latin name of the oil source plant ("Morinda citrifolia L.") should be mentioned in the beginning of the abstract as well as the main text, in italic, with the first letter in capital case. The plant is a tropical one, but not every reader might be familiar with it. So, more general introduction about this plant should be given.

4) The meaning of TIC has not been defined. Also, in Table 1 the TIC values are followed with so many digits, making it difficult to read. So, I would rather suggest to use scientific notation, or use proper order of magnitudes (k, m, etc.).

5) Also, The name of the carbon chains are not properly written. The initial letters of these carbon chain names do not need to be in capital case, and some of the names are with errors.

6) Figure 2 and Figure 3 can be combined, and this helps the reader to compare them. Fig. 5 and Fig. 6 can also be combined. By the way, why use both "Figure" and "Fig." in the figure title? The authors should pay attention to the journal's format requirements.

7) In Fig. 7, 8 and 9, where are the error margins of those data? Can the experiments and measurements be reproducible?

Compose

- Inbox
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

- Meet
- New meeting
 - Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
Start a new one

90 of 186

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: Authors compared two kinds of surfactants in the deinking process, and the natural fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil performed better than the synthetic one. The unsaturated C=C structure of the surfactant is the key factor to form intermolecular bonds with the ink particles and weaken the molecular bonds of the ink. I recommend the publication in "Materialia" after minor revision.

1. what's the role of the hydrophilic group of the surfactants during the deinking process? The hydrophilic groups are different between the natural surfactant and the synthetic one in the manuscript, why not choose surfactants with the same hydrophilic group? Besides the hydrophilic groups, the hydrophobic groups, HLB, and the carbon numbers are all different between the two surfactants, how these factors affect the deinking respectively? Authors should explain more in detail.
2. How does the fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil compared with commercial deinking agents?
3. What the NF and BL means in Fig 7?

Reviewer #2: This manuscript reported the use of fatty acid derived from morinda citrifolia oil as surface-active chemicals on ink removal. The manuscript can be useful, but major revision is needed before it can be published.

- 1) The title of the paper needs to be improved so as to better reflect the content of the research. The title starts with "recent experimental advances", making it like a review paper, but in fact it is a research article.
- 2) The work reported uses fatty acid from morinda citrifolia oil for ink removal, but the fruit of morinda citrifolia can be used for food and traditional herb, so would the use of the seed oil for ink removal be cost effective? Or the seed is a kind of waste stream so the method reported by this research is a strategy of utilizing inexpensive food waste for value-added applications? Some general introduction on this aspect could be meaningful.
- 3) The Latin name of the oil source plant ("Morinda citrifolia L.") should be mentioned in the beginning of the abstract as well as the main text, in italic,

Compose

- Inbox
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

Hangouts
No recent chats
Start a new one

90 of 186

Your Submission Inbox x

Materialia <em@editorialmanager.com> Tue, Mar 15, 2:06 PM
to me

Ms. Ref. No.: MTLA-D-22-00113
Title: Recent experimental for understanding the deinking process of waste paper – The role of fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil
Materialia

Dear Dr. Trismawati,

The reviewers have commented on your above paper. They indicated that it is not acceptable for publication in its present form.
However, if you feel that you can suitably address the reviewers' comments (included below), I invite you to revise and resubmit your manuscript.
Please carefully address the issues raised in the comments.

If you are submitting a revised manuscript, please also:

- a) outline each change made (point by point) as raised in the reviewer comments

AND/OR

- b) provide a suitable rebuttal to each reviewer comment not addressed

Compose

- Inbox
- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

- Meet
- New meeting
- Join a meeting

Hangouts
No recent chats
Start a new one

Navigation icons: back, forward, archive, trash, mute, snooze, flag, delete, print, share, etc.

94 of 186

Editor handles MTLA-D-22-00113

Materialia <em@editorialmanager.com> Sat, Feb 5, 9:51 PM
to me

Ms. Ref. No.: MTLA-D-22-00113
Title: Recent experimental for understanding the deinking process of waste paper – The role of fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil
Materialia

Dear Dr. Trismawati,

Your submission "Recent experimental for understanding the deinking process of waste paper – The role of fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil" will be handled by Editor Evelyn KF Yim.

You may check on the progress of your paper by logging on to the Editorial Manager as an author.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Editorial Manager
Materialia

Compose

Inbox

Starred

Snoozed

Important

Sent

Drafts

Meet

New meeting

Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
Start a new one



95 of 186

A manuscript number has been assigned: MTLA-D-22-00113

Inbox x



Materialia <em@editorialmanager.com>

Sat, Feb 5, 9:51 PM



to me

Ms. Ref. No.: MTLA-D-22-00113

Title: Recent experimental for understanding the deinking process of waste paper – The role of fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil
Materialia

Dear Dr. Trismawati,

Your submission "Recent experimental for understanding the deinking process of waste paper – The role of fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil" has been assigned manuscript number MTLA-D-22-00113.

To track the status of your paper, please do the following:

1. Go to this URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/mtla/>
2. Enter your login details
3. Click [Author Login]
This takes you to the Author Main Menu.
4. Click [Submissions Being Processed]

Compose

Inbox

- Starred
- Snoozed
- Important
- Sent
- Drafts

Meet

- New meeting
- Join a meeting

Hangouts

No recent chats
Start a new one



103 of 189

Submission Confirmation Inbox x



Materialia <em@editorialmanager.com>
to me

Wed, Jan 26, 8:48 PM

Dear Dr. Trismawati,

We have received your article "Recent experimental for understanding the deinking process of waste paper – The role of fatty acid of morinda citrifolia oil" for consideration for publication in Materialia.

Your manuscript will be given a reference number once an editor has been assigned.

To track the status of your paper, please do the following:

1. Go to this URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/mtla/>
2. Log in as an Author
3. Click [Submissions Being Processed]

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

